
Digital Portfolio as an Authentic Assessment Instrument in Arabic Language Learning: A Literature Review

Moch Ubaidillah ¹⁾, Ali Al Haddad ²⁾, Namlul Wadi ³⁾, Nur Qomari ⁴⁾

^{1, 2, 3, 4)} Master of Arabic Language Education, Postgraduate Program, State Islamic University Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang

Moch Ubaidillah

Email : ubaidcoy@gmail.com
alihaddad2002@gmail.com
namlulwadi88@gmail.com
qomari@uin-malang.ac.id

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji efektivitas portofolio digital sebagai instrumen penilaian otentik dalam pembelajaran Bahasa Arab. Dengan menggunakan pendekatan studi pustaka, artikel ini menganalisis enam penelitian terkini yang relevan, baik dari jurnal nasional terakreditasi maupun jurnal internasional. Hasil analisis menunjukkan bahwa portofolio digital mendukung penilaian terhadap keempat keterampilan berbahasa Arab, yaitu menyimak, berbicara, membaca, dan menulis, melalui dokumentasi tugas dan kinerja siswa secara berkelanjutan. Selain itu, portofolio digital mendorong motivasi belajar dan refleksi diri siswa, serta memungkinkan pemberian umpan balik yang lebih personal dan konstruktif. Namun demikian, penerapannya masih menghadapi tantangan teknis dan pedagogis, seperti kesiapan guru dan keterbatasan infrastruktur. Kesimpulan dari studi ini menegaskan bahwa portofolio digital memiliki potensi besar dalam mendukung penilaian otentik Bahasa Arab, asalkan didukung dengan pelatihan guru, perencanaan rubrik yang matang, serta kolaborasi antara berbagai pihak di lingkungan pendidikan.

Kata kunci: portofolio digital, penilaian otentik, pembelajaran Bahasa Arab, keterampilan berbahasa.

Abstract

This study aims to examine the effectiveness of digital portfolios as an authentic assessment instrument in Arabic language learning. Using a literature review approach, the article analyzes six recent and relevant studies from both accredited national and international journals. The findings reveal that digital portfolios support the assessment of the four Arabic language skills—listening, speaking, reading, and writing—through continuous documentation of student tasks and performance. Moreover, digital portfolios enhance students' learning motivation and self-reflection, while enabling more personalized and constructive feedback. However, implementation still faces technical and pedagogical challenges, such as teacher readiness and infrastructure limitations. The study concludes that digital portfolios hold significant potential to support authentic assessment in Arabic learning, provided they are complemented by teacher training, well-designed rubrics, and collaborative support within the educational environment.

Keywords: digital portfolio, authentic assessment, Arabic learning, language skills.

INTRODUCTION

In the era of ever-evolving digital transformation, the world of education is experiencing a significant paradigm shift, including in the approach to learning evaluation. Assessment is no longer only understood as an effort to measure cognitive mastery of knowledge through written tests, but also as an integral process in learning that is holistic, contextual, and authentic (Mahmudi et al., 2023). Authentic assessment (authentic assessment) emerged as a response to the limitations of traditional evaluation models. This assessment focuses on students' ability to apply knowledge and skills in real-world contexts, by assessing the learning process and products in a holistic manner comprehensive (Rosyidah, 2021). In language learning, especially Arabic, this kind of assessment approach is very important, because language mastery is a communicative skill that can only be measured through actual performance in language (Al-Ghazo, 2023).

Arabic as a language that is not only communicative but also symbolic in a religious context, demands an integrative learning approach. The Arabic learning process involves four main skills: listening (*istimā'*), speaking (*kalām*), reading (*qirā'ah*), and writing (*kitābah*) (Al-Hawamleh et al., 2022). Assessment of these skills requires instruments that are able to reflect learning outcomes authentically, not just the final result, but also the process and reflection that accompanies it. In this context, digital portfolios are one of the assessment instruments that are increasingly receiving attention (Abrar-ul-Hassan et al., 2021). Digital portfolios are electronic documentation of students' work, processes, and reflections during learning. Through this media, teachers and students can monitor the development of competencies in a sustainable and structured manner (Alzouebi, 2020).

Several previous studies have shown that digital portfolios have great potential in supporting language learning. A study by (Febriani et al., 2020) found that the use of digital portfolios in Arabic language learning can significantly improve students' writing skills through reflective practice and independent revision. A study by (Laili, 2019), highlighted how digital portfolios contribute to the formation of students' learning independence in project-based language learning. Meanwhile, a study by (Arestia, 2019) in an Arab university environment revealed that digital portfolios facilitate competency-based learning and provide space for students to demonstrate personal progress. However, these studies generally focus more on pedagogical or motivational aspects, and have not explicitly analyzed digital portfolios within an authentic assessment framework, especially in Arabic language learning.

In addition, there are still limitations in the literature that systematically examines how digital portfolios can be integrated as the main instrument in authentic assessment practices. The lack of synthesis of theory and practice related to this has resulted in teachers and curriculum developers not yet having a strong foundation in implementing it (Husin, 2024). In fact, with the development of educational technology and the demands of the Independent Curriculum which prioritizes formative and authentic assessments, a deep understanding of digital portfolio-based assessment instruments is very relevant and urgent (Lestari et al., 2019).

Based on the background and development of the literature, this article aims to review and synthesize various research findings and theoretical approaches related to the use of digital portfolios as authentic assessment instruments in Arabic language learning. This literature review is expected to provide a comprehensive conceptual mapping, identify gaps in previous research, and provide new directions for the development of more adaptive, reflective, and meaningful learning evaluations in the context of Arabic language learning in the digital era.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research uses a qualitative approach with a literature study method (library research), namely the collection and analysis of data sourced from relevant literature, such as books, journal articles, proceedings, and research reports that discuss the topics of digital portfolios, authentic assessment, and Arabic language learning (Lorenzetti, 2007). Data was obtained through identification and in-depth review of six scientific articles published in reputable international and national journals from Google Scholar, Garuda, and ResearchGate, with publication criteria between 2020 and 2025, and using Indonesian and English.

The collected data were analyzed descriptively-qualitatively to identify the main concepts, relationships between variables, and important findings in the literature. The focus of the analysis was directed at how digital portfolios are used as authentic assessment instruments, especially in the context of Arabic language learning. The analysis technique used was content analysis without the application of statistical models, considering the nature of this study which is non-empirical and based on literature review according to (Wallen & Fraenkel, 2013).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The following is a literature review table containing six articles related to the use of digital portfolios and authentic assessment in Arabic language learning. This table is arranged based on aspects of the author and title, research methods, theories used, findings, and novelty of each study.

Table 1: Analysis of Previous Studies

Author, Title & Year of Publication	Research methods	Theory Used	Research result	Novelty
Ibrahim & Rakhshani (2024), Portfolio assessment among upper-intermediate learners...	Quasi-experiment	Motivation theory and grit (Duckworth), willingness to communicate (MacIntyre)	Portfolio assessment significantly improves student motivation, grit, and participation in the context of foreign language learning.	Explaining the direct relationship between portfolios and three main affective variables in language learning
ElMeftahy (2025), Arabic Language Education Assessment through International Experiences	Comparative study	Authentic assessment and communicative approach	Countries with technology-based authentic assessment systems are more successful in Arabic language learning	A cross-country comparative study in the context of digital-based Arabic language assessment
Mujadilah et al. (2024), Development of Product and Portfolio Skills Assessment...	Research and Development (R&D)	Bloom's Taxonomy, Authentic Assessment	The use of creative product portfolios strengthens skills-oriented Arabic language learning.	Integrating local culture-based assignments as part of the Arabic portfolio
Hoerudin (2020), Portfolio Assessment in Arabic Language Learning...	Descriptive qualitative study	Authentic assessment according to O'Malley and Valdez Pierce	Portfolios are able to display students' overall development through creative work.	Focus on documentation of progress and forms of assessment based on student creativity.

Kaukab et al. (2021), Authentic Assessment in Arabic Language Learning	Qualitative field study	Authentic assessment, a constructivist approach	Authentic assessment encourages active participation and enhances students' expressive skills.	Emphasizes the relationship between student reflection and language skill improvement.
Jannah et al. (2024), Problems of Implementing Authentic Assessment...	Case study	Theory of implementation of educational policy	Significant obstacles were found, such as limited technology and teacher readiness.	Focus on factors inhibiting the implementation of authentic assessment in schools with limited resources.

A search of six articles between 2020 and 2025 shows that the use of digital portfolios as an authentic assessment instrument in Arabic and other foreign language learning is gaining increasing attention. A variety of methods are used, ranging from quasi-experiments to model development and qualitative studies, with theoretical foundations that include authentic assessment, communicative approaches, and affective and reflective aspects of language learning.

In general, previous research results state that digital portfolios can increase learning motivation, active student participation, and language skills. However, if examined more deeply, there are still several research gaps. (research gap) which is the basis of this study. First, most previous studies have not specifically examined the context of Arabic language learning in Indonesia, either in terms of teacher readiness, infrastructure, or curriculum (Mujadilah et al., 2024). Second, the focus of existing research tends to be limited to certain skills such as writing or reading, while this study offers a comprehensive assessment approach to the four main Arabic language skills: *istimā'*, *kalām*, *qirā'ah*, and *kitābah* (Mirrota & Nailasari, 2020).

Third, there is a lack of literature review that specifically discusses the implementation model of digital portfolios that are applicable and can be adapted by teachers in the field (Rahman & Kaukab, 2021). This study attempts to fill this gap by compiling a directed and simple literature review that is relevant to Arabic language learning. On this basis, the following section will discuss the findings and discussions related to the effectiveness and implementation of digital portfolios as authentic assessment instruments.

DIGITAL PORTFOLIO AS AN AUTHENTIC ASSESSMENT INSTRUMENT IN ARABIC LANGUAGE

Analysis of recent literature shows that digital portfolios have become an increasingly popular and relevant instrument in the practice of authentic assessment of language skills, including in the context of Arabic language learning. In the authentic assessment approach, the main focus is not on how much theory students have mastered, but rather on the extent to which they are able to apply language in real terms in various communicative contexts (Kaukab, 2021). This makes authentic assessment an evaluation approach that supports competency-based learning outcomes, where learning outcomes are assessed through concrete evidence of student performance in authentic situations.

In Arabic language learning, authentic assessment through digital portfolios is closely aligned with the communicative approach that underlies modern pedagogy of language teaching. This approach emphasizes mastery of four main language skills: *istimā'* (listening), *kalām*

(speaking), qirā'ah (reading), and kitābah (writing). Through digital portfolios, teachers can not only assess the final results of an assignment, but can also monitor students' learning processes in a gradual, continuous, and systematically documented manner. This provides a distinct advantage over conventional assessments that are one-time in nature and often do not reflect the full development of learning (Nurjanah, 2020).

As a concrete illustration, the ability of the kitabah can be measured from the results of writing assignments such as personal journals, picture descriptions, or thematic essays that students collect in digital format. Meanwhile, kalam skills can be assessed through recordings of oral presentations, conversation practices, or Arabic vlogs uploaded by students. This model not only assesses communication skills, but also encourages students to present their work creatively and independently. Research (Hoerudin, 2020) provides real evidence that the use of digital portfolios can facilitate students in producing original works such as educational posters and narrative texts in Arabic. Assessment of these works is carried out authentically through a digital platform, which allows teachers to provide feedback quickly and continuously. This not only enriches students' learning experiences but also increases accountability in the evaluation process.

INTEGRATION OF ARABIC LANGUAGE SKILLS IN DIGITAL PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT

One of the main findings of this literature analysis is that digital portfolios have great potential to integrate the four Arabic language skills holistically in an authentic assessment process. Although most of the studies analyzed still tend to focus on the application of portfolios on only one or two skills—especially writing (kitābah) and reading (qirā'ah)—this study emphasizes the importance of developing a portfolio assessment model that integrates all basic language skills: *istimā'*, *kalām*, *qirā'ah*, and *kitābah*. This is important so that the assessment carried out is not partial, but reflects the mastery of Arabic in a complete and contextual manner.

Digital portfolios allow teachers to assess *kalām* skills through video recordings of conversations, oral presentations, or project reports delivered verbally in Arabic. With the support of digital media, assessment of speaking skills is no longer limited to direct oral performance in class, but can be done asynchronously, giving students space to prepare and reflect on their performance. This also provides teachers with flexibility in time to conduct more thorough evaluations.

For the skill of *kitabah*, students can be asked to upload various types of writing, ranging from descriptions, narratives, to argumentative texts, which are created gradually according to the level of ability and learning themes. Teachers can utilize digital features to provide direct comments or notes for improvements on each submitted manuscript. This approach creates a constructive learning-feedback cycle and strengthens the formative assessment process.

In terms of *qirā'ah*, digital portfolios can be used to document students' recordings while reading Arabic texts. Assessment of aspects of *makhārij al-ḥurūf*, understanding of content, and intonation and clarity of reading can be done more objectively. Teachers can also ask students to write reflections or summaries of the texts they read to measure their understanding in writing. In *istimā'*, students can be given the task of listening to short audio, lectures, or dialogues in Arabic, then asked to write a summary or provide an oral response (ElMeftahy & Ahmiani, 2025). The results of this task are uploaded to the portfolio as evidence of listening comprehension performance. This approach also supports integration between skills, for example by linking the results of *istimā'* to the tasks of *kitabah* or *kalam*.

Several studies such as (Ibrahim & Rakhshani, 2024) have shown that students involved in portfolio-based assessment with an integrative approach showed improvements in several skills at once, as well as showing higher engagement in the learning process. This reinforces the urgency of developing a digital portfolio assessment system that not only focuses on the final

product, but also describes the relationship between skills and the student's learning process as a whole.

THE BENEFITS OF DIGITAL PORTFOLIO ON LEARNING MOTIVATION AND REFLECTION

Digital portfolios in Arabic language learning not only function as an evaluation tool, but also become an important means to foster learning motivation and develop students' reflective awareness of their learning process and outcomes. Through portfolios, students can see the development of their skills over time, so that a sense of achievement and responsibility for their own progress arises. This is very relevant in foreign language learning, including Arabic, which requires time and consistency in mastering skills.

One of the main benefits shown by literature studies is the increase in students' intrinsic motivation when they feel that their tasks are not only assessed as numbers, but also valued as a process and work. When tasks such as writing essays, recording presentations, or reading texts aloud are recorded and stored in a portfolio, students feel that their efforts are documented and have long-term value. This builds emotional attachment and commitment to the learning process itself. Research by (Kaukab, 2021) confirms that authentic portfolio-based assessments encourage students' self-expression, strengthen their sense of ownership of learning outcomes, and significantly increase students' participation in Arabic language learning.

In addition to motivation, digital portfolios also strengthen the reflective dimension in the learning process. With the documentation of tasks sequentially and continuously, students have the opportunity to review mistakes, improve understanding, and develop new strategies for subsequent tasks. This process forms metacognitive skills that are very important in continuous learning. For example, students can compare the text they wrote at the beginning of the semester with the writing at the end of the semester, then draw conclusions about the improvement of vocabulary, sentence structure, or clarity of ideas. In this case, the teacher acts as a facilitator who provides feedback, either in the form of written comments, audio, or video directly through the portfolio platform (Febriani et al., 2020).

Digital features also enable fast, targeted two-way interaction between teachers and students. Teachers can provide timely feedback that is not only corrective, but also constructive and motivating. In turn, students can respond to the feedback with revisions or additional comments, resulting in a deep pedagogical dialogue. This creates a learning environment that is collaborative, personal, and supports differential learning (Ubaidillah, 2025).

IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES AND DEVELOPMENT IMPLICATIONS

Although digital portfolios have proven effective in assessing authentic Arabic language skills, their implementation in the field still faces a number of challenges that cannot be ignored. One of the main obstacles is teacher readiness, both in mastering technology and in designing authentic assessments that are in accordance with the characteristics of Arabic language learning (Saher et al., 2022). Many teachers are not yet accustomed to using digital platforms as evaluation media, especially in schools with limited technological facilities. This has an impact on the less than optimal use of digital portfolios as a measuring tool for student skill development.

Another limitation that is often faced is the workload of teachers in assessing and managing portfolios individually. Unlike traditional forms of assessment that are instant and uniform, portfolios require time, consistency, and accuracy in assessing student development over time. Without a structured assessment system such as a clear rubric and an integrated platform, the assessment process can be inefficient and prone to subjectivity (Ghany & Alzouebi, 2019).

In addition, the results of the analysis also show that most previous studies still emphasize the general application of digital portfolios in language learning, and have not

specifically developed a contextual and systematic digital portfolio-based authentic assessment model for Arabic language learning. This is one of the important gaps that needs to be answered by further research (Humairoh & Ubaidillah, 2025).

To address these challenges, several strategic solutions can be implemented. First, technical training for Arabic teachers on the use of digital portfolio platforms such as Mahara, Google Sites, or Padlet is essential to improve their digital literacy. Second, the development of assessment rubrics tailored to each language skill (*istimā'*, *kalām*, *qirā'ah*, and *kitābah*) needs to be carried out so that the assessment process is more objective, efficient, and easy to implement. Third, a collaborative approach involving teachers, students, and parents also needs to be strengthened so that the documentation and evaluation process runs more smoothly and gets full support from the learning environment (Abrar-ul-Hassan et al., 2021).

Thus, digital portfolios can not only be optimized as evaluation tools, but also as integral components in a modern, competency-based Arabic language learning system, as long as they are supported by adequate human resource readiness and support systems.

EFFECTIVENESS OF DIGITAL PORTFOLIO IN ARABIC LANGUAGE LEARNING.

The effectiveness of digital portfolios in Arabic language learning is reflected through several important indicators identified from the results of the literature review. First, digital portfolios have been shown to be able to increase students' active involvement in the learning process. This is shown in the study of Ibrahim & Rakhshani (2024), which states that the use of portfolios is positively correlated with student motivation and participation in foreign language classes.

Second, effectiveness is also seen from the increasing reflective ability and autonomy of students' learning. Through continuous documentation in the form of digital works, students can reflect on the development of their competencies, identify strengths and weaknesses, and develop learning improvement strategies. Hoerudin's (2020) research emphasizes that digital portfolios provide space for students to demonstrate creativity and overall skill development.

Third, from the teacher's perspective, digital portfolios are effective because they provide concrete, authentic evidence of students' learning achievements in the four main Arabic language skills: *istimā'*, *kalām*, *qirā'ah*, and *kitābah*. The ability to track the learning process over time allows teachers to conduct formative and summative assessments more objectively. This is in line with the findings of ElMeftahy (2025) who showed that technology-based assessments provide advantages in terms of documentation, transparency, and accountability.

Finally, the effectiveness of digital portfolios is also reflected in the improvement of student learning outcomes. In several studies, the use of digital portfolios contributed to better grades, especially in productive skills such as writing and speaking. This improvement is due to the cycle of revision and feedback that occurs dynamically through digital platforms.

Thus, the effectiveness of digital portfolios in Arabic language learning lies not only in the evaluative aspect, but also in its function as a reflective, motivational, and pedagogical medium that strengthens students' language skills holistically.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the literature analysis of the six selected articles, it can be concluded that digital portfolios are an authentic assessment instrument that is relevant and effective in Arabic language learning. This instrument is able to accommodate the four language skills-*istimā'*, *kalām*, *qirā'ah*, and *kitābah*-in an integrated manner, and encourage a more sustainable, participatory, and development-oriented assessment process for students as a whole. Digital portfolios also contribute to increasing students' learning motivation and self-reflection through systematic documentation of the learning process and providing constructive feedback. However, the effectiveness of implementing digital portfolios still faces technical and

pedagogical challenges, especially in terms of teacher readiness and supporting infrastructure. Therefore, developing an integrated, practical digital portfolio model, accompanied by teacher training and collaborative support, is an important step to maximize the potential of this authentic assessment in Arabic language learning.

REFERENSI

- Abrar-ul-Hassan, S., Douglas, D., & Turner, J. (2021). Revisiting second language portfolio assessment in a new age. *System*.
- Al-Ghazo, A. (2023). Authentic assessment strategies used to improve distance learning outcomes. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*.
- Al-Hawamleh, M. S., Alazemi, A. F., & ... (2022). Digital portfolio and self-regulation in speaking tasks. ... and *Foreign Language* <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40862-022-00141-w>
- Alzouebi, K. (2020). Electronic portfolio development and narrative reflections in higher education: Part and parcel of the culture? *Education and Information Technologies*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-019-09992-2>
- Arestia, P. (2019). *Implementasi Penilaian Autentik Pada Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Smp N 17 Bandar Lampung*. repository.radenintan.ac.id.
- ElMeftahy, N., & Ahmiani, O. (2025). Arabic Language Education Assessment through International Experiences: A Comparative Analysis: المقارن التحليل: دولية تجارب خلال من العربية اللغة تعليم تقويم. *Journal of*
- Febriani, S. R., Wargadinata, W., & ... (2020). Design of Arabic learning for senior high school in the 21st century. ... *Bahasa Arab*.
- Ghany, S. A., & Alzouebi, K. (2019). Exploring teacher perceptions of using e-portfolios in public schools in the United Arab Emirates. *International Journal of Education and*
- Hoerudin, H. (2020). Penilaian Portofolio dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab di MA Puteri PUI Majalengka. *Al-Ishlah At-Tarbiyah*.
- Humairoh, S. W., & Ubaidillah, M. (2025). IMPLEMENTASI PENDEKATAN TEKNOLOGI DALAM PENGEMBANGAN KURIKULUM MERDEKA PADA PEMBELAJARAN BAHASA ARAB DI MTS MATSARATUL HUDA PANEMPAN PAMEKASAN. *AL-MUADDIB: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Kependidikan*, 7(1), 186–193.
- Husin, M. (2024). Analisis Metode Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab Berbasis Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) dalam Literatur Pendidikan. *Jurnal Al-Kifayah: Ilmu Tarbiyah Dan*
- Ibrahim, K. A. A., & Rakhshani, Y. (2024). Portfolio assessment among upper-intermediate learners: effects on learners' willingness to communicate, grit tendencies, and motivation. *Asian-Pacific Journal of Second* <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40862-024-00257-1>
- Kaukab, M. E. (2021). *Penilaian autentik dalam pembelajaran bahasa arab*. *NIVEDANA: Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Bahasa*, 2 (1).
- Laili, F. N. (2019). *penilaian autentik pada pembelajaran tematik integratif di kelas ii-a mi ma'arif patihan wetan babadan ponorogo*. etheses.iainponorogo.ac.id.
- Lestari, G., Mahbubah, A., & ... (2019). Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab Digital dengan Menggunakan Media Padlet di Madrasah Aliyah Bilingual Batu. *Proceeding of*
- Lorenzetti, D. L. (2007). *Identifying appropriate quantitative study designs for library research*. journals.library.ualberta.ca.
- Mahmudi, I., Imani, A., Indriyanti, C. Y., & ... (2023). Impact of Portfolio Authentic Assessment on Students' Learning Outcomes of Nahwu at Modern Islamic Boarding School. ... *of Arabic Language*
- Mirrota, D. D., & Nailasari, D. (2020). Problematika Implementasi Penilaian Autentik Pada Mata Pelajaran Al-Qur'an Hadis Di MTs Negeri Gandusari Blitar. *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi*
- Mujadilah, S., Rahmawati, S., & ... (2024). Pengembangan Penilaian Keterampilan Produk dan Portofolio Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Arab di Kelas XI SMA Al Wafi IBS Bogor. *Mauriduna: Journal of*
- Nurjanah, N. F. (2020). *IMPLEMENTASI PENILAIAN AUTENTIK DALAM PEMBELAJARAN BAHASA ARAB DI MA AL-MUHAJIRIN BANDAR SAKTI ABUNG SURAKARTA LAMPUNG* repository.radenintan.ac.id.
- Rahman, R. A., & Kaukab, M. E. (2021). Penilaian Autentik Dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab. *Jurnal*

Komunikasi & Bahasa.

- Rosyidah, I. (2021). *The authentic assessment for assessing the students' productive skills during online learning in MTs At Taqwa Bondowoso*. etheses.uin-malang.ac.id.
- Saher, A. S., Ali, A. M. J., Amani, D., & Najwan, F. (2022). Traditional Versus Authentic Assessments in Higher Education. *Pegem Journal of Education and ...*
- Ubaidillah, M. (2025). TRANSFORMASI PENDIDIKAN DI PONDOK PESANTREN DALAM MEWUJUDKAN SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs): KAJIAN SISTEMATIS TERHADAP INOVASI DI ERA DIGITAL. *As-Sulthan Journal of Education*, 1(3), 649–660.
- Wallen, N. E., & Fraenkel, J. R. (2013). Reviewing the Literature. *Educational Research*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410601001-5>